

Inclusive Participation or Exclusive Right? The Politics of Democratic Participation through ‘Free Prior and Informed Consultations’ in Andean Latin America

Lorenza Fontana and Jean Grugel
(University of Sheffield)

Abstract

In Latin America the introduction of practices of participatory governance in the natural resource sector has become entwined with the multicultural imperative. Across the world, indigenous people inhabit and claim land rights in areas that are environmentally protected and often extraordinarily rich in terms of biodiversity and renewable and non-renewable resources. In recent years, record oil prices, growing global demand, and commodity-based national economic strategies have led to unprecedented levels of natural resource exploration and extraction in indigenous areas. In this context, some Latin American states, especially in the Andean region, have put in place a range of reforms to devolve certain land and natural management rights to indigenous peoples.

The tensions around collective rights and participatory governance on natural resource management are the subject of this article. In particular, we explore the challenges of participation through the lens of multiculturalism and its potential for creating inclusive and effective forms of decision-making for marginalized social groups. Empirically, it examines a recent attempt to establish more participative forms of environmental governance for indigenous communities in Bolivia through the Free Prior and Informed Consultation (FPIC). Rooted in international human rights law, this framework aims at achieving more effective bottom-up participation by establishing an obligation on the state to consult indigenous peoples before large development projects get underway.

We argue that the FPIC is not a neutral exercise that will automatically lead to better governance and a more equal society. Instead its implementation embeds existing social, cultural and economic tensions with criteria of representation and legitimacy, inclusiveness and the management of common goods. Ultimately, we question a linear conceptualization of the relationship between democracy and rights and consider equality and inclusion not as teleologies of participation, but as the result of contingent political processes.

Lorenza Fontana is a Post-doctoral Research Associate at the Sheffield Institute for International Development (SIID), University of Sheffield (UK). Her research interests include collective action and conflict studies, human rights, and new models of citizenship and governance in Latin America. Her recent articles have been published in *Environment and Planning D*, *The Journal of Peasant Studies*, *Global Governance*, *Latin American Perspective*, *Bulletin of Latin American Research* and *Critique Internationale*.

Jean Grugel is Professor of International Development and Director of Sheffield Institute for International Development (SIID). Recent publications include the coauthored books *Democratization: A Critical Introduction* (Palgrave-Macmillan, London, 2014), *The Politics of Poverty Reduction* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2012), the book *Democratization* (Four Volumes, ed., Sage, London 2013) as well as papers in *Human Rights Quarterly*, *Journal of European Public Policy*, *Development and Change*, *Progress in Development Studies*, *Citizenship Studies* and *Journal of International Development*.

Contacts

Sheffield Institute for International Development (SIID)

University of Sheffield

ICOSS Building, 219 Portobello Road

Sheffield, S1 4DP

United Kingdom

Telephone: +44 114 222 6068

E-mails: l.fontana@sheffield.ac.uk; j.b.grugel@sheffield.ac.uk